

NOTE: This disposition is nonprecedential.

**United States Court of Appeals  
for the Federal Circuit**

---

**CHART TRADING DEVELOPMENT, LLC,**  
*Appellant*

v.

**INTERACTIVE BROKERS LLC, NINJATRADER  
GROUP, LLC, NINJATRADER, LLC,  
TRADESTATION GROUP, INC., TRADESTATION  
SECURITIES, INC., TRADESTATION  
TECHNOLOGIES, INC.,**  
*Appellees*

---

2018-1102, 2018-1104

---

Appeals from the United States Patent and Trade-  
mark Office, Patent Trial and Appeal Board in Nos.  
CBM2016-00038, CBM2016-00039.

---

**JUDGMENT**

---

JAMES R. BARNEY, Finnegan, Henderson, Farabow,  
Garrett & Dunner, LLP, Washington, DC, argued for  
appellant. Also represented by JUSTIN LOFFREDO,  
TIMOTHY P. McANULTY.

DANIELLE J. HEALEY, Fish & Richardson, PC, Hou-

ston, TX, argued for all appellees. Appellees TradeStation Group, Inc., TradeStation Securities, Inc., TradeStation Technologies, Inc. also represented by BAILEY KATHLEEN HARRIS; MARIA ELENA STITELER, Minneapolis, MN; ADAM J. KESSEL, Boston, MA; JOHN C. PHILLIPS, San Diego, CA.

MICHAEL T. ROSATO, Wilson, Sonsini, Goodrich & Rosati, PC, Seattle, WA, for appellee Interactive Brokers LLC. Also represented by MATTHEW A. ARGENTI, Palo Alto, CA.

BENJAMIN LIEB, Talus Law Group LLC, Denver, CO, for appellees NinjaTrader Group, LLC, NinjaTrader, LLC.

---

THIS CAUSE having been heard and considered, it is

ORDERED and ADJUDGED:

PER CURIAM (NEWMAN, PLAGER, and MOORE, *Circuit Judges*).

**AFFIRMED. See Fed. Cir. R. 36.**

ENTERED BY ORDER OF THE COURT

December 17, 2018  
Date

/s/ Peter R. Marksteiner  
Peter R. Marksteiner  
Clerk of Court